

#### REPORT OF THE 19th MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

#### Auckland, New Zealand, 1 - 6 Sep 2014





#### Main topics

- Review of SBT fisheries and fisheries indicators
- SBT stock assessment and projections
- Estimation of unaccounted catch mortality
- Evaluation of exceptional circumstances
- SBT stock status and management advice
- Evaluation of carry-forwards between quota blocks
- Modifications to CCSBT SOP standards
- Scientific research program for 2015 2017



## Review of SBT Fisheries and Fisheries Indicators



#### Reported SBT Global Catches 1952 - 2013



#### 1952 1954 1956 1958 1960 1962 1964 1966 1968 1970 1972 1974 1976 1978 1980 1982 1984 1986 1988 1990 1992 1994 1996 1998 2000 2002 2004 2006 2008 2010 2012

#### Reported southern bluefin tuna catches by flag, 1952 to 2013



#### SBT Distribution Range 1976 - 2013





#### Juvenile indices in the GAB

- The 2014 scientific aerial survey index (AS) of age 2 4 abundance is the highest value in the time series
- The commercial SAPUE index also increased from 2013 to 2014 but to a lesser extent
- The trolling survey index declined slightly between 2013 and 2014



#### **Recruitment Indicators**



Scientific aerial survey index of relative abundance of juvenile SBT in the Great Australian Bight SAPUE index of relative surface abundance of juvenile SBT in the Great Australian Bight



#### **Recruitment Indicators**



Trends of trolling catch index of age 1 SBT in the Western Australia



Japanese longline CPUE

- Longline CPUE for the Japanese fleet for ages 6 and 7 increased steadily from 2007 to 2012 but decreased in 2013
- CPUE index for ages 8 11 decreased from 2008 to 2011 but increased in 2012 and 2013
- The age 12+ CPUE decreased from 2008 to 2010 and then fluctuated around a low level since



#### Age 3+ Biomass Indicators



Nominal CPUE of ages 3 through 12+ SBT for Japanese longliners



#### Indonesian length frequencies

- In 2012 13 and 2013 14 there was a decline in the mean length of SBT on the spawning ground, with a new mode of relatively small/young fish in the Indonesian catch
- It has not been determined if the catch of smaller fish comes from the spawning ground and if they are mature



### Lengths on the spawning ground



Length frequency of SBT caught on the spawning ground by spawning season



- The Aerial Survey and SAPUE indices both increased from 2013 to 2014, but the troll index decreased slightly
- Japanese longline CPUE
  - increased for ages 6&7 from 2007 to 2012 and then declined;
  - > increased in the last two years for the 8 -11 age group; and
  - decreased for the 12+ age groups from 2008 to 2010 and then remained low
- Mean length of SBT on the spawning ground has declined, but its cause(s) are unknown



## Stock assessment and projections



## Stock assessment and projections in 2014

#### For the Base Case

- The stock remains at a very low level estimated to be 9% of the initial SSB, and below the level to produce maximum sustainable yield (MSY)
- However there has been some improvement since the 2011 stock assessment
- B10+ relative to initial is estimated to be 7% which is up from the estimate of 5% in 2011
- Probability of reaching rebuilding target of 20% B<sub>0</sub> by 2035 was 74%



#### Summary of stock status from 2014

| Maximum Sustainable Yield                 | 33,000t (30,000-36,000)   |
|---|---------------------------|
| Reported (2013) Catch                     | 11,726t                   |
| Current Replacement Yield                 | 44,600t (35,500 - 53,600) |
| Current (2014) Spawner Biomass (B10+)     | 83,000t (75,000 - 96,000  |
| Current depletion (current relative to in | nitial)                   |
| • SSB                                     | 0.09 (0.08 - 0.12)        |
| • B10+                                    | 0.07 (0.06 - 0.09)        |
| SSB (2014) Relative to SSB <sub>msy</sub> | 0.38 (0.26 - 0.70)        |

F(2013) Relative to F<sub>msy</sub> 0.66 (0.39–1.00)



#### **Spawning Biomass and Recruitment**



Recruitment and spawning stock biomass for the base case, showing the medians and 90th percentiles. The blue line with the light blue region shows those for the previous assessment calculated in 2011.



#### **Estimates of MSY**



Estimated MSY based on annual age-specific mean weight and selectivity estimates as computed over the base grid of the operating model



#### **Estimates of F**





## Unaccounted catch mortality



- Current stock status estimates appear to be unaffected by the unaccounted mortality scenarios tested
- There are impacts on the projections and rebuilding performance from the unaccounted mortality scenarios
- If total mortalities are as large as those considered in the added catch scenario (an added 1000t of large fish plus 1000t of small fish) then impacts on the rebuilding plan may be substantial (probability of rebuilding to 20% B<sub>0</sub> by 2035 drops to 49%)
- Unaccounted mortality of large fish impacts on rebuilding early and of small fish the impact is later



#### **Unaccounted Catch Mortality**



Trajectories of a) recruitment, b) biomass of age 10+ fish, c) predicted catch, d) biomass for the "Added Catch" sensitivity scenario.

The green line with the greenish yellow region shows the median and 90% intervals of each scenario. The grey line and region shows the base case result.



- The added catch scenario was potentially plausible given the available data, information and anecdotal market reports
- The probability of rebuilding for this scenario was similar to but not worse than the most pessimistic scenario tested in 2011
- Under the projections of the different scenarios the MP appeared to be working to reduce TACs when unaccounted mortality was occurring, but not enough to meet the rebuilding target
- ESC requests that the EC and CC urgently provide detailed information and data to properly assess impacts of unaccounted mortalities



- ESC has made suggestions in Attachment 5 in regard to further possible initiatives to improve the estimation of any unaccounted mortality in the surface fishery, of catches by non-members, and of (unreported) catches by members by improved market monitoring
- The ESC encourages all countries to make their CDS data and information on market monitoring available to facilitate and improve analyses
- However, any items related to the details of individual vessels are not required



ESC Members estimating the SBT catch of Non-Members in the IOTC and WCPFC regions by analogy with the SBT catch rates of Members fishing in the same 5 X 5 areas (Attachment 6)

In addition to improve the data available for stock assessment and the MP, the ESC specifically requests:

- CC and EC provide information on catches of SBT by Non-Members
- CC and EC review and analyse market data from Members to improve estimates of catch (both weight and size)
- Members provide their CDS data to the ESC to facilitate and improve analyses



## **Exceptional Circumstances**



- In 2011 the CCSBT also adopted the meta-rule process as the method for dealing with exceptional circumstances in the SBT fishery (ESC 2013).
- The meta-rule process describes:
  - (1) the process to determine whether exceptional circumstances exist
  - (2) the process for action; and
  - (3) the principles for action



- It appears that significant levels of unaccounted mortality may have occurred which were not considered in the design of the MP
- If these levels are indeed true, they would amount to exceptional circumstances because the probability of rebuilding under the MP will be well below what was intended by the EC
- The ESC also notes that continuing to follow the MP as proposed does lead to continued rebuilding in the short term even if the circumstances of the hypothesised additional unaccounted mortality are true



- Hence, the ESC advises the EC to continue to follow the MP as formulated but, as a matter of urgency, to take steps to quantify all sources of unaccounted SBT mortality
- If substantial levels of unaccounted mortality are confirmed, then there will be a need to retune the MP to achieve the EC's stated rebuilding objective
- In addition, the ESC advises that the EC take steps to ensure adherence to its TACs



## **SBT Assessment and Management**



#### Recommendations for 2014

- Based on the results of the MP operation for 2015-17 and the outcome of the application of the meta-rule process, including review of exceptional circumstances, the ESC recommends that:
  - There is no need to revise CCSBT's 2013 TAC decision regarding the TACs for 2016 - 17
  - ➤ The recommended annual TAC for 2016 17 is 14,647.4 t
- The ESC recommends that an allocation of 5.95 t per year be made to cover mortality associated with approved research projects



# Carry-forward of unfished allocations



#### **Carry-forward**

- Projections on the impact of carry-forward between three year quota blocks were run for the base case assuming:
  - > No carryover (i.e., the standard base run); and
  - Carryover of 20% of the TAC from the third year of each three year block to the first year of the following three year block.
- There was negligible difference between the projections, with carry-forward of unfished allocations between quota blocks having no adverse impact on the outcomes of meeting the rebuilding target (1%)



#### **Carry-forward**

- The ESC noted that these calculations were conducted for the current situation where the stock is increasing so that further consideration would be required if the stock was not increasing
- It was further noted that a review of the MP is scheduled for 2017 and that the carry-forward provisions and any other catch-related management changes being considered by the EC should be considered in that review
- The ESC recommended that any catch-related management changes proposed by the EC should be evaluated by the ESC for impact on the performance of MP before such changes are implemented



# Scientific Research Program for 2015 - 2017



### Scientific Research Program for 2015 - 2017

The ESC identified the following key research areas:

- Improved information on key uncertainties in the Indonesian fishery
- Adult biomass indices
- Recruitment abundance indices
- Estimates of adult mortality
- Estimates of select biological parameters selectivity, fecundity
- Estimates of total catch
- Preparation for formal review of the MP in 2017



### Scientific Research Program for 2015 - 2017

- The costs of the SRP will increase over the three years of the program
- ESC notes that the Performance Review of the CCSBT suggests that CCSBT costs are extremely low compared to the value of the fishery (paragraph 172) and that the cost increase for the 3 year research plan is well justified



## Review of the 2015 Work Schedule



The proposed workplan has the following key elements:

- Evaluation of fishery indicators and exceptional circumstances
- Further work on genotyping approaches to inform decisions on longer-term approach
- Expert review workshop on the approaches
- Gene tagging design study
- Aging of otoliths
- Continued collection of close-kin samples
- Scientific aerial survey



### 2014 - 15 Proposed Workplan

| Activity   | Approximate Period         | Resources or approximate budgetary implications <sup>1</sup>                   |
|--|----------------------------|--|
| Continuation of tag recovery efforts   | Tag recovery is continuous | \$1,000 for tag rewards on the basis that few recaptures are expected to occur |
| Provide SBT Stock Status Report to the other tuna RFMOs                                | Aug – Nov 2014             | No additional cost   |
| Collation of information on<br>unreported mortalities and<br>categorize by "OM" fleets | Jan - Jun 2015             | All members  |
| Proposed SRP activities for 2015:  | Jan - Dec 2015             |  |
| <ol> <li>Continued collection of close kin<br/>(CK) samples</li> </ol>                 |                            | <ol> <li>CCSBT - \$35,000</li> <li>CCSBT - \$85,000</li> </ol>                 |
| 2. Work on genotyping approaches   |                            | 3. Australia (CSIRO)   |
| 3. Expert review workshop  |                            |  |
| <ol> <li>Design study for future gene-tagging<br/>studies</li> </ol>                   |                            | 4. CCSBT: \$75,000   |
| 5. Aging Indonesian ototliths  |                            | 5. CCSBT: \$15,000   |
| 6. Scientific aerial survey  |                            | 6. CCSBT: up to \$800,000  |



#### 2014 -15 Proposed Workplan (continued)

| Activity  | Approximate Period                                  | Resources or approximate budgetary implications <sup>1</sup>                                |
|---|---|---|
| Routine OMMP code maintenance<br>and development                    | Jan - Jul 2015 (Data inputs<br>after data exchange) | Australia/Consultant 5 days   |
| CPUE webinar to review progress of inter-sessional CPUE work        | April 2015  | Japan, Australia, New Zealand,<br>Taiwan, Korea and possibly<br>Indonesia. Three panel days |
| Standard Scientific Data Exchange                                   | Apr – Jul 2015                                      | No additional cost  |
| Technical workshop to evaluate possible changes in the OM structure | 2 days immediately prior to ESC (30-31 Aug.)        | Two panel members, 1 Secretariat staff  |



#### 2013 -14 Proposed Workplan (continued)

| Activity   | Approximate Period                 | Resources or approximate budgetary implications <sup>1</sup>              |
|--|------------------------------------|---|
| <ul> <li>Extended Scientific Committee for<br/>the 19<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Scientific<br/>Committee. The meeting will focus<br/>on the following:</li> <li>Regular review of indicators</li> <li>Evaluation of application of<br/>meta-rules</li> <li>Review results of SRP activities</li> <li>Specify requirements for MP<br/>review in 2017</li> </ul> | 1 - 5 Sep 2015 (Incheon,<br>Korea) | ESC Chair, full panel, full<br>interpretation and 3 Secretariat<br>staff. |



## END

