



CCSBT-CC/2310/06

Review of Implementation of Indonesia's and South Africa's Corrective Actions

1. CCSBT's Corrective Actions Policy (CPG3)

CCSBT's Corrective Actions Policy (CPG3) sets out a framework to respond to evidence of non-compliance by a Member including SBT catch in excess of annual catch limits. Its primary response focus is to assist Members to achieve capacity to effectively comply with CCSBT obligations.

This paper examines progress (if any) that has been made against agreed corrective actions for Indonesia and South Africa.

In summary, the currently agreed corrective actions are that:

- Indonesia is to repay its past over-catch in accordance with an agreed payback plan; and
- South Africa is to submit its corrective plan of action, as well as its required reports and data, uphold its obligation to attend meetings, and participate regularly in a contact group convened by the Executive Secretary.

2. Update on Indonesia's Implementation of its Payback and Management Plans

2.1 Background

Indonesia's reported SBT catch exceeded its Total Available Catch¹ in both its 2019 and 2020 fishing seasons². Indonesia's combined 2019 and 2020 over-catch was 456.584t. CCSBT 27³ agreed an initial Payback Plan for Indonesia to repay its over-catch at a rate of 91.8t per year between 2022 to 2026 inclusive. In 2021, Indonesia had a small under-catch (of 0.085t) and a revised Payback Plan was subsequently agreed by CCSBT 28⁴ (**Attachment A**) for Indonesia's over-catch to be repaid at a slightly reduced rate of 91.3t per year between 2022 to 2026 inclusive.

Note that Indonesia submitted an updated management plan to CC17, describing its implementation progress (paper [CCSBT-CC/2210/23 Rev1](#)). That plan is provided for reference at **Attachment B**. No further updates to the management plan had been received at the time of finalising this paper.

¹ Total Available Catch means a Member's Effective Catch Limit allocation for that quota year plus any amount of unfished allocation carried forward to that quota year; Effective Catch Limit means the Member's National Allocation plus or minus any agreed short-term changes to that allocation, for example temporary transfers and/or allowances

² Indonesia's fishing season starts on 1 January and ends on 31 December

³ Refer to Attachment 8 of the 27th Meeting of the Extended Commission (EC 27's) [report](#)

⁴ Paragraphs 69 and 75 of EC28's [report](#)

2.2 Update on Indonesia's Reported Catch (2022 and 2023)

With regard to the implementation of Indonesia's Payback Plan (**Attachment A**) the Secretariat reports that:

- After taking into account its 2022 payback instalment (91.3t), Indonesia's Total Available Catch for 2022 is 1,031.5t⁵. Indonesia's reported catch of SBT for 2022 is 1,031.397t, *i.e.* 103kg less than its Total Available Catch for 2022. According to reported monthly catches submitted for January to August 2023 inclusive, Indonesia's total reported SBT catch for 2023 to date is 554.36t. Therefore, to date, Indonesia's 2023 SBT catch currently remains well within its 2023 Total Available Catch Limit of 1,031.5t (Table 1).

Table 1

2023 – Indonesia (as at 12/09/2023)	Unit: Tonnes⁶
A. Total Available Catch (t ⁶)	1,031.50
B. Reported Catch (t ⁶) – up until 31 August 2023	554.36
Difference (A - B) (t⁶)	477.14

3. Update on South Africa's Action Plan to Address its Non-Compliance

CC16 and CC17 noted various areas of non-compliance for South Africa in 2020 and 2021 respectively including:

- Data were not provided for the Ecologically Related Species (ERS) Data Exchange process;
- Data were not provided for the Scientific Data Exchange process;
- Lack of provision of a National Report to the ERS Working Group (ERSWG);
- Lack of provision of National Reports to the Extended Scientific Committee (ESC);
- Lack of attendance of some meetings, in particular the ESC and CC;
- Uncertainties regarding South Africa's total Southern Bluefin Tuna (SBT) attributable mortalities as the Catch Documentation Scheme (CDS) estimated catch is substantially higher than the catch reported in South Africa's National Report and Monthly Catch Reports.
- Occasional unauthorised vessels; and
- Data submission issues, including some CDS documents not being submitted or submitted up to six months late, CDS forms submitted with duplicate numbers, submission of incomplete or non-compliant CDS forms, and port inspection reports often being submitted up to a year late.

The Secretariat advises that many of the same compliance issues appear to have continued during 2022/23.

In 2022, EC29 noted and agreed some important points with respect to South Africa and its non-compliance, and South Africa responded with multiple assurances. Key relevant paragraphs from the [report of EC29](#) are provided below:

⁵ Calculated by taking Indonesia's Effective Catch Limit for 2022 (1,122.8t), and then subtracting Indonesia's payback for 2022 (91.3t), resulting in 1031.5t of Total Available Catch for 2022

⁶ Whole weight

54. *In response to the compliance concerns noted, South Africa thanked the Secretariat and Chairs and stated its commitment to do more that is required to meet its CCSBT obligations and to work constructively and cooperatively to address all critical outstanding compliance matters. It explained that it had lost many officials recently, especially those responsible for tuna and tuna-like species fisheries, as well as having had issues migrating its systems and infrastructure from one department over to the new department (DFFE).*

55. *Members had some sympathy with South Africa's situation noting that they would like South Africa to clarify if it can submit its corrective plan of action, as well as its required reports and data, and uphold its obligation to attend meetings.*

56. *Japan expressed its concern, as an importer, about the case of SBT shipments with no CDS forms or CDS forms containing incorrect information, or the case where tags from previous years were being used, and that it would like to work with South Africa to resolve these issues.*

57. *South Africa appreciated the assistance offered by Members and committed to respond to all outstanding compliance matters including providing a timeframe within which to do so.*

58. *Following further discussion, South Africa advised that it was unable to nominate a specific date when its Plan and associated timeline would be available but noted they would be submitted by CCSBT 30. South Africa also committed to maintaining regular contact with the Secretariat and assisting Members in the interim.*

59. *Members requested that South Africa's Plan be provided in advance of CCSBT 30. To assist South Africa and ensure regular communications are maintained, it was agreed the Executive Secretary would convene a contact group comprised of Secretariat personnel, potentially the CC Chair, and any assisting Members who wished to participate. This group will communicate with South Africa on a regular basis until CCSBT 30 to assist South Africa to resolve issues, and to help give direction to the process of developing and delivering South Africa's Plan and timeline prior to CCSBT 30.*

The Secretariat advises that at the time of finalising this paper:

- Repeated attempts by the Executive Secretary to convene a contact group to assist South Africa with the development of its Compliance Plan had failed to illicit a response;
- South Africa had not responded to outstanding compliance matters including providing a timeframe within which to do so; and
- South Africa had not submitted its corrective plan of action, as well as its required reports and data, nor upheld its obligation to attend all meetings.

4. Action Required

CC18 is invited to:

- For Indonesia:
 - Review the information provided on Indonesia's implementation of its payback plan; and
 - Advise EC 30 on the effectiveness of the plan to date and recommend whether the Payback Plan should remain as agreed by CCSBT 28 (refer to **Attachment A**) or if it needs to be updated.

- For South Africa:
 - Note that South Africa has not responded to outstanding compliance matters, has not fulfilled the commitments it made to provide a corrective action plan and has not improved its meeting attendance.
 - Make recommendations to EC 30 regarding:
 - Appropriate measures to take given that South Africa has not engaged in the corrective actions process to date.

Prepared by the Secretariat

INDONESIA'S CURRENTLY AGREED PAYBACK PLAN*(Source: Paragraph 69, Table 3 of Report of EC of CCSBT 28)***Gradual Pay Back for Indonesia's Over-catch in 2019 - 2020**

TAC 2020 after pay back	Total catch 2020	Final total over- catch 2020	Gradual Pay Back (5 years)	
			Year	Pay Back
841t	1,298t	457t	2022	91.3 t
			2023	91.3 t
			2024	91.3 t
			2025	91.3 t
			2026	91.3 t

		and punishment application towards the catch quota/vessel			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In order to avoid over catch, DGCF will also send an additional notification letter to inform that SBT catch reach/almost reach 90% limit. There will be also a reminder to reduce/cease catch of SBT for remaining fishing season and daily information on catch level.
5	Tagging control	Reduce tagging on port activities	DGCF and Tuna Fisheries Association	2021 - 2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduce tagging on port activities by conducting regular dissemination to the tuna associations and companies holding quotas regarding the provisions on tagging at port. • Fishing vessel brought tags onboard prior fishing operation.
6	E-logbook	Improve e-logbook implementation for LL vessels above 30 GT as an obligation and under 30 GT as a voluntary.	DGCF & Tuna Fisheries Association	Since 2019	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In 2019, there were 221 Indonesian fishing vessels registered in the CCSBT Record of Authorized Vessels with 84 vessels have implemented an e-logbook (> 30 GT). • In 2020, there were 250 Indonesian fishing vessels registered in the CCSBT Record of Authorized Vessels with 174 vessels have implemented the e-logbook

Attachment B

					<p>(≤ 30 GT = 23 vessels; > 30 GT = 151 vessels).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In 2021, there were 265 Indonesian fishing vessels registered in the CCSBT Record of Authorized Vessels with 224 vessels have implemented the e-logbook (≤ 30 GT = 50 vessels; > 30 GT = 174 vessels). • In 2022 (January - August), there were 255 Indonesian fishing vessels registered in the CCSBT Record of Authorized Vessels with 182 vessels have implemented the e-logbook (≤ 30 GT = 45 vessels; > 30 GT = 137 vessels).
7	E-monitoring	E-monitoring for supporting/carrier fishing vessels and LL vessel above 100 GT	DGCF & Tuna Fisheries Association	2021 - 2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • E-monitoring is obligatory for carrier vessel. • E-monitoring on fishing vessel is not mandatory. The plan to implement e-monitoring on longline vessel above 100 GT in voluntary basis has not been implemented yet due to budget constrain.
8	Catch analysis by fishing area	Data analysis of SBT catches to identify SBT was caught weather at the territorial waters, archipelagic waters, Indonesian EEZ, or high seas. The data analysis will be conducted by overlaying various data such as CDS,	DGCF, RITF	2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A paper has been developed to a data analysis of SBT catches to identify whether SBT was caught at the territorial sea, archipelagic water, EEZ, or high seas. The data analysis will be conducted by

Attachment B

		fishing logbooks, e-Monitoring and VMS data.			<p>overlaying various data such as CDS, fishing logbooks, and VMS data. The paper has been submitted to the ESC27.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An updated paper has been submitted to the CC17.
9	Market trade data	Consolidation to all market data resources	DGCF, DGPCMF, AFQ, PUSDATIN, Statistics Indonesia, Indonesia Customs	2021	MMAF has conducted a consultation process with related national export tuna data resources including Statistics Indonesia and Indonesia Customs. The result of the consultation presented in the paper (Further investigation into discrepancies between COMTRADE and Indonesia CDS data) submitted to CC16.
10	Fisheries Improvement Program (FIP) for tuna longliner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase observer coverage. • Data collecting improvement • ERS mitigation • Improving compliance on the regulations related to longline tuna enforced by the Government • Conducting training and/or awareness activities to fishing industries to ensure compliance 	Tuna Fisheries Association	2021 - 2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The FIP for tuna longliner is not only for vessel catching SBT or registered on CCSBT. • During 2021, there were 318 longline vessels that are members of the FIP. While the vessels that have been placed observers were as many as 21 vessels. • Data collecting improvement In 2020, One Data System employs about 5,210 enumerators assigned to all over Indonesia. It increased 6% compared to 2019 (4937 enumerators). Meanwhile, there were 198 regencies

					<p>which sampled for data collection during year 2020.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ERS mitigation Tuna Association has conducted training on the ERS mitigation for companies joined FIP program. • Improving compliance on the regulations related to longline tuna enforced by the Government The government collaborated with tuna association has regularly conducted dissemination to the quota holder company. • Conducting training and/or awareness activities to fishing industries to ensure compliance. • As per 23rd September, 2022, there are 339 longline vessels that are members of the FIP. While, 17 observers have been deployed in 17 vessels member of FIP. • In June 2022, all FIP members attended refreshment briefing on e-logbook recording as part of data collecting improvement. • In April 2022, FIP participated in the meeting organised by Directorate of Fish Resources Management (DFRM) to
--	--	--	--	--	---

					<p>develop 2021 observer on board report.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FIP will support the development of ETP report by providing information on ETP caught by FIP members.
--	--	--	--	--	---

Note:

MMAF = Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries

DGCF = Directorate General of Capture Fisheries

DGMFRS= Directorate General of Marine and Fisheries Resources Surveillance

DGSCMFP= Directorate General of Strengthening Competitiveness of Marine and Fishery Products

DGFQ= Directorate General of Fish Quarantine, Quality Control and Safety of Fishery Products

PUSDATIN = Center for Data, Statistic, and Information, Statistics Indonesia-MMAF

DFRM = Directorate of Fish Resources Management

RITF= Research Institute for Tuna Fisheries, MMAF

ATLI = Indonesia Longline Tuna Association